

**Subject:** RE: Two Action Items/Decisions Needed from GBIRd Steering Committee

**From:** <Peter.Brown@csiro.au>

**Date:** 7/26/2017 3:31 AM

**To:** <TompkinsD@landcareresearch.co.nz>, <karl.campbell@islandconservation.org>, <Toni.J.Piaggio@aphis.usda.gov>, <dwthreadgill@tamu.edu>, <godwin@ncsu.edu>

**CC:** <royden.saah@islandconservation.org>, <John.D.Eisemann@aphis.usda.gov>, <gregg.howald@islandconservation.org>, <fred\_gould@ncsu.edu>, <paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au>, <john\_godwin@ncsu.edu>

Hi all,

I agree this is a good discussion and agree with the sentiments. Thanks Dan for putting the two alternate propositions together. I favour the "Fred" version and think we need to ensure consistency in web sites and communications, but we will be asked about future prospects and other applications, so maybe it comes down to wordsmithing in how we frame this.

Regards,

Peter.

**Dr Peter R. Brown**

Senior Research Scientist | Agriculture & Global Change  
CSIRO Agriculture & Food

E Peter.Brown@csiro.au T 02 6246 4086 M 0406 753 365

Black Mountain Laboratories, Clunies Ross St, Black Mountain ACT 2601  
GPO Box 1700, Canberra, ACT 2601

www.csiro.au | <http://people.csiro.au/B/P/Peter-Brown.aspx>

---

**From:** Daniel Tompkins [mailto:TompkinsD@landcareresearch.co.nz]

**Sent:** Wednesday, 26 July 2017 11:40 AM

**To:** Karl Campbell <karl.campbell@islandconservation.org>; Piaggio, Antoinette J - APHIS <Toni.J.Piaggio@aphis.usda.gov>; 'David Threadgill' <dwthreadgill@tamu.edu>; jrgodwinnc@gmail.com <godwin@ncsu.edu>

**Cc:** Royden Saah <royden.saah@islandconservation.org>; Brown, Peter (A&F, Black Mountain) <Peter.Brown@csiro.au>; Eisemann, John D - APHIS <John.D.Eisemann@aphis.usda.gov>; Gregg Howald <gregg.howald@islandconservation.org>; Fred Gould <fred\_gould@ncsu.edu>; paul.thomas (paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au) <paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au>; John Godwin <john\_godwin@ncsu.edu>

**Subject:** RE: Two Action Items/Decisions Needed from GBIRd Steering Committee

Apologies for being late to this – just back from annual leave.

I agree with the general consensus as well, but just want clarification on whether we are agreeing to:

- “the focus being on island biodiversity as articulated in the paper and noting the potential future benefits in other areas” (John G) or
- “focus solely on our mission of eradication of invasive rodents from islands where they harm biodiversity” (Fred).

I prefer the second take (i.e. not even noting other benefits in other areas on the website). My main reasoning is that many see conservation use as a backdoor for adoption for agricultural purposes, and this may expose the current GBIRd focus to undue flak.

Cheers, Dan.

(and Fred, yes, NZ is just a whole range of islands of different sizes – we don't do the mainland thing...)

---

**From:** Karl Campbell [<mailto:karl.campbell@islandconservation.org>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, 25 July 2017 8:44 a.m.  
**To:** Piaggio, Antoinette J - APHIS; 'David Threadgill'; [jrgodwinnc@gmail.com](mailto:jrgodwinnc@gmail.com)  
**Cc:** Royden Saah; [Peter.Brown@csiro.au](mailto:Peter.Brown@csiro.au); Eisemann, John D - APHIS; Gregg Howald; Fred Gould; paul.thomas ([paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au](mailto:paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au)); John Godwin; Daniel Tompkins  
**Subject:** RE: Two Action Items/Decisions Needed from GBIRd Steering Committee

I also agree.

Cheers,  
Karl

---

**From:** Piaggio, Antoinette J - APHIS [<mailto:Toni.J.Piaggio@aphis.usda.gov>]  
**Sent:** Monday, July 24, 2017 8:13 AM  
**To:** 'David Threadgill' <[dwthreadgill@tamu.edu](mailto:dwthreadgill@tamu.edu)>; [jrgodwinnc@gmail.com](mailto:jrgodwinnc@gmail.com) <[godwin@ncsu.edu](mailto:godwin@ncsu.edu)>  
**Cc:** Royden Saah <[royden.saah@islandconservation.org](mailto:royden.saah@islandconservation.org)>; [Peter.Brown@csiro.au](mailto:Peter.Brown@csiro.au); Eisemann, John D - APHIS <[John.D.Eisemann@aphis.usda.gov](mailto:John.D.Eisemann@aphis.usda.gov)>; Karl Campbell <[karl.campbell@islandconservation.org](mailto:karl.campbell@islandconservation.org)>; Gregg Howald <[gregg.howald@islandconservation.org](mailto:gregg.howald@islandconservation.org)>; Fred Gould <[fred\\_gould@ncsu.edu](mailto:fred_gould@ncsu.edu)>; paul.thomas ([paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au](mailto:paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au)) <[paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au](mailto:paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au)>; John Godwin <[john\\_godwin@ncsu.edu](mailto:john_godwin@ncsu.edu)>; [tompkinsd@landcareresearch.co.nz](mailto:tompkinsd@landcareresearch.co.nz)  
**Subject:** RE: Two Action Items/Decisions Needed from GBIRd Steering Committee

agreed

---

**From:** David Threadgill [<mailto:dwthreadgill@tamu.edu>]  
**Sent:** Sunday, July 23, 2017 6:52 PM  
**To:** John Godwin <[godwin@ncsu.edu](mailto:godwin@ncsu.edu)>  
**Cc:** Royden Saah <[royden.saah@islandconservation.org](mailto:royden.saah@islandconservation.org)>; [Peter.Brown@csiro.au](mailto:Peter.Brown@csiro.au); Piaggio, Antoinette J - APHIS <[Toni.J.Piaggio@aphis.usda.gov](mailto:Toni.J.Piaggio@aphis.usda.gov)>; Eisemann, John D - APHIS <[John.D.Eisemann@aphis.usda.gov](mailto:John.D.Eisemann@aphis.usda.gov)>; Karl Campbell <[karl.campbell@islandconservation.org](mailto:karl.campbell@islandconservation.org)>; Gregg Howald <[gregg.howald@islandconservation.org](mailto:gregg.howald@islandconservation.org)>; Fred Gould <[fred\\_gould@ncsu.edu](mailto:fred_gould@ncsu.edu)>; paul.thomas ([paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au](mailto:paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au)) <[paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au](mailto:paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au)>; John Godwin <[john\\_godwin@ncsu.edu](mailto:john_godwin@ncsu.edu)>; [tompkinsd@landcareresearch.co.nz](mailto:tompkinsd@landcareresearch.co.nz)  
**Subject:** Re: Two Action Items/Decisions Needed from GBIRd Steering Committee

I agree as well

On Jul 23, 2017, at 5:32 PM, John Godwin <[godwin@ncsu.edu](mailto:godwin@ncsu.edu)> wrote:

Hi All,  
Apologies for missing last week's meeting.

On the first item, I think the principles are articulated well.

On the second item, I would favor the focus being on island biodiversity as articulated in the paper and noting the potential future benefits in other areas.

I also wanted to note that I spoke Friday with a writer for *Science*, Kelly Servick, who may be in contact as I described the other participating institutions and investigators to her. She wasn't sure if this would be a story coming up soon or instead something they would follow and cover later.

- John

On Sat, Jul 22, 2017 at 8:48 PM, Royden Saah <[royden.saah@islandconservation.org](mailto:royden.saah@islandconservation.org)> wrote:

Hi All, - **Suggestion - schedule 15 minutes on your calendar to review the below info and share your decisions to the group.**

Per our last meeting, we need two decisions made by the steering committee. **First** is agreeing to the Principles as communicated in Karl's paper. He combined what he found in the strat plan draft and the website. Please email agreement or share your thoughts/suggestions with the group. Thanks:

*The program's guiding principles help provide context for decision making:*

1. *Proceed cautiously, with deliberate step-wise methods and measureable outcomes;*
2. *Engage early and often with the research community, regulators, communities and other stakeholders;*
3. *Maintain an uncompromising commitment to biosafety, existing regulations, and protocols as minimum standards (e.g. NASEM, 2016; AAS, 2017);*
4. *Use, and participate in developing best practices;*
5. *Operate in countries with appropriate regulatory capacity; and*
6. *Be transparent with research, assessments, findings, and conclusions.*

**SECOND issue** is the framing of this technology to benefit human health and agriculture, in addition to preventing extinctions. Fred shared his thoughts at the last committee meeting. I reviewed the website which appears to promote these benefits, if not directly, then thru suggestion, starting with the opening statement, "Like you, we want to save lives, support livelihoods, and preserve our world for generations to come. Every year billions of dollars are lost to damaged infrastructure, crop losses and the associated hunger, and disease and illnesses caused by invasive rodents." There is also mention of GBIRD's humanitarian mission. The implication is that this technology is for the purposes framed in the opening statements.

Karl's paper, in contrast, focuses mainly on preserving island biodiversity, but touches on potential distant future applications lightly in the discussion section, rather than strong or initial statements. "*In addition to impacting biodiversity on islands, invasive rodents also negatively impact the health of people and their livestock, and greatly reduce agricultural productivity, stored food stocks and damage infrastructure. In the future, these problems may also benefit from the development of gene drive systems in invasive rodents. However, our program is currently focussed on the development and evaluation of gene drives in invasive rodents on islands to prevent biodiversity loss. This complements our step-wise approach and reflects National Academies' recommendations (NASEM, 2016; AAS, 2017).*"

The suggestion is to align communication to the scientific community and to the general

public. If not completely aligned, then clarifying the program's intention regarding health vs. ag. Vs. island ecology clarified to the public regarding the program's. In conversation with Fred, his main issue is that we will need to defending the use of our technology for continental use in Ag and heath arenas.

Please email your decision to align website with our manuscript or to keep status quo.

Thanks in Advance,  
Royden

---

**From:** Royden Saah  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 19, 2017 4:06 PM  
**To:** [Peter.Brown@csiro.au](mailto:Peter.Brown@csiro.au); Piaggio, Antoinette J - APHIS <[toni.j.piaggio@aphis.usda.gov](mailto:toni.j.piaggio@aphis.usda.gov)>; 'Eisemann, John D - APHIS' <[John.D.Eisemann@aphis.usda.gov](mailto:John.D.Eisemann@aphis.usda.gov)>; Karl Campbell ([Karl.Campbell@islandconservation.org](mailto:Karl.Campbell@islandconservation.org)) <[Karl.Campbell@islandconservation.org](mailto:Karl.Campbell@islandconservation.org)>; Gregg Howald <[Gregg.Howald@islandconservation.org](mailto:Gregg.Howald@islandconservation.org)>; Fred Gould ([fred\\_gould@ncsu.edu](mailto:fred_gould@ncsu.edu)) <[fred\\_gould@ncsu.edu](mailto:fred_gould@ncsu.edu)>  
**Cc:** David Threadgill <[dwthreadgill@tamu.edu](mailto:dwthreadgill@tamu.edu)>; paul.thomas ([paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au](mailto:paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au)) <[paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au](mailto:paul.thomas@adelaide.edu.au)>; John Godwin <[john\\_godwin@ncsu.edu](mailto:john_godwin@ncsu.edu)>; [tompkinsd@landcareresearch.co.nz](mailto:tompkinsd@landcareresearch.co.nz)  
**Subject:** Draft Notes from Steering Committee Meeting

Here they go – please review and comment.

Cheers  
rs

J. Royden Saah  
Project Manager  
Island Conservation  
[www.islandconservation.org](http://www.islandconservation.org)  
skype: roydensaah  
mobile (in Australia): [+61 459 610 332](tel:+61459610332)

--

\*\*\*\*\*

John Godwin  
Department of Biological Sciences, North Carolina State University  
mail: Dept. Biological Sciences, Box 7614, NCSU,  
Raleigh, NC 27695-7617  
Office location: 156 David Clark Laboratories  
phone: 919-513-2936, fax: 919-515-5327  
website: <http://godwin.wordpress.ncsu.edu/>

\*\*\*\*\*

This electronic message contains information generated by the USDA solely for the intended recipients. Any unauthorized interception of this message or the use or disclosure of the information it contains may violate the law and subject the violator to civil or criminal penalties. If you believe you have received this message in error, please notify the sender and delete the email immediately.

---

Please consider the environment before printing this email

Warning: This electronic message together with any attachments is confidential. If you receive it in error: (i) you must not read, use, disclose, copy or retain it; (ii) please contact the sender immediately by reply email and then delete the emails.

The views expressed in this email may not be those of Landcare Research New Zealand Limited. <http://www.landcareresearch.co.nz>

---

Please consider the environment before printing this email

Warning: This electronic message together with any attachments is confidential. If you receive it in error: (i) you must not read, use, disclose, copy or retain it; (ii) please contact the sender immediately by reply email and then delete the emails.

The views expressed in this email may not be those of Landcare Research New Zealand Limited. <http://www.landcareresearch.co.nz>